



Mr Simon Mounce
Hull City Council, Planning Development
Control
2nd Floor, Guild Hall
Alfred Gelder Street
Hull
HU1 2AA

Direct Dial: 01904 601961

Our ref: L01061091

17 April 2019

Dear Mr Mounce

**Arrangements for Handling Heritage Applications Direction 2015
& T&CP (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2015
& Planning (Listed Buildings & Conservation Areas) Regulations 1990**

**LAND TO THE NORTH OF CASTLE STREET AND SOUTH EAST OF
WATERHOUSE LANE INCLUDING CASTLE BUILDINGS AND THE EARL DE
GREY PUBLIC HOUSE, KINGSTON UPON HULL, HU1 2DA
Application Nos 19/00334/LBC & 19/00333/FULL**

Thank you for your letters of 8 April 2019 regarding the above applications for listed building consent and planning permission. On the basis of the information available to date, we offer the following advice to assist your authority in determining the applications.

Summary

The proposal seeks to provide a new viable and sympathetic use for two vacant Grade II listed buildings. We are broadly very supportive of the proposal but advise that some amendments should be sought and further detailed method statements are needed to ensure that the proposal is achievable in a way that conserves both Grade II listed buildings in a manner appropriate to their heritage significance. We have concerns at present regarding the application on heritage grounds. The following advice sets out what is required in order for the proposal to address the requirements of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act (1990) sections 16 and 66 and Chapters 12 and 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) (February 2019).

Historic England Advice

Significance of the heritage assets, including the contribution setting makes to significance

The Earl de Grey, Grade II listed (originally known as the Junction Dock Tavern) dates from the early-mid C19 and originally formed part of a block comprising 6, 7 and 8



37 TANNER ROW YORK YO1 6WP

Telephone 01904 601948
HistoricEngland.org.uk





Castle Street. It is a rendered brick with faience ground floor of circa 1913, slate roof, three-storeys. It is a good example of a C19 pub altered in the early C20 through the addition of an elaborate faience (decorative ceramic) shopfront. It is one of only a few early buildings left remaining on the western half of Castle Street, one of the oldest routes into Hull, and is important as a physical reminder of dock life in this part of the town.

The Earl de Grey Public House figures prominently in the history of Hull. The considerable communal heritage value of the Listed Building also derives from its connection to the shipping industry and as a result the diverse communities that frequented the building during the long history of the building as a public house. Castle Street developed within the context of a maritime hub and its urban mix served dock workers and seamen. The interior of the building has been heavily altered and has been excluded from the listing.

The Castle Buildings, Grade II listed was constructed in 1900 as the offices of steamship owners and brokers. It is designed in the Renaissance Revival Style by B S Jacobs of Kingston upon Hull and uses mellow brick with ashlar dressings and a slate roof, two storeys plus attic. It has a striking curved frontage that takes full advantage of its prominent corner location on one of the oldest routes into Hull. The distinctive form of the building combined with the polychromatic treatment of the elevations and four chimneys make this a distinctive landmark building particularly in views from the west.

The building's original function as a shipping office remains legible through the numerous historic features retained in the interior. The internal layout and historic features that survive make a very strong contribution to the significance of the building. There is clear differentiation between more formal meeting spaces, offices and the general public. Being located close to the docks it is an important physical reminder of Hull's maritime history and trading links, and has been occupied by a succession of maritime-related tenants throughout its history until the 1970s.

The setting of both Listed Buildings has been affected by the loss of surrounding buildings and the widening of the A63 Castle Street in the 1970s. The dual carriageway runs close to the principal façade of Earl de Grey. However, the Castle Buildings in particular remains an important touchstone to the past townscape as it marks the corner of Castle Street and Waterhouse Lane. The erosion of the historic setting of the listed buildings presents an opportunity for their setting to be enhanced through redevelopment.

Impact on the significance of the heritage assets

Significance (for heritage policy) is defined in the NPPF as the 'value of a heritage asset to this and future generations because of its heritage interest, that interest may be archaeological, architectural, artistic or historic'; it derives not only from a heritage asset's physical presence, but also from its setting'.



The widening of the A63 Castle Street in the 1970s increased how the busy road impinges on the Earl de Grey. The demolition of the Earl de Grey is currently being proposed in order to facilitate the A63 'Castle Street Improvement Scheme'. Regardless of this we consider that that the current scheme for both listed buildings offers the opportunity and potential to secure their futures which would deliver public and heritage benefits.

The proposal involves relatively minor changes to the Castle Buildings and overall its heritage significance will be maintained. Any detailed matters such as doors, floor and wall linings affecting historic surfaces will need to be agreed to the satisfaction of your Principal Conservation Officer.

The proposal will improve the setting of both listed buildings. The recently developed Bonus Arena and public open space has created the opportunity for an active frontage along Waterhouse Lane. Repositioning the Earl de Grey to address this space will create a new public space from where the faience facade will be appreciated. The closer proximity to the Castle Buildings and will also strengthen the urban grain, along with the new hotel building.

Given that the proposal in its current form would result in harmful impacts to the significance of the Earl de Grey we advise that these impacts should be avoided where possible and then minimised. The Planning Statement refers to the application being supplemented in due course following the preparation of a Heritage Impact Assessment. We suggest the following amendments in order to ensure that the proposal complies with the requirements of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) (February 2019) Chapters 12 and 16 and the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (sections 16 and 66): -

- The re-erected the Earl de Grey should be brought forward so that the frontage is 'back of pavement' in the traditional manner, flush with the Castle Buildings. This is in order to ensure its prominence in the streetscape is fully achieved.
- More of the external form and principal walls of the listed building should be rebuilt to ensure the legibility of the building envelope so that it reads as separate from the Castle Buildings.
- The proposed internal layout of the repositioned Earl de Grey as proposed does not respond positively to its significance. A major portion of the interior is proposed to be used for a new staircase which compromises the amount of useable space. We advise that a new staircase should be smaller, ideally a bespoke carpentry piece but if it needs to be larger we question whether the staircase could be reconfigured and relocated to the modern extension (glazed link building) thus removing this element from the listed part of the building.
- The proposed elevations should be revisited so that the fenestration matches the existing, including the proportions of the chimney stack.

- The new main entrance doors should be double doors to a traditional design.

Opportunities for appropriate enhancements should be considered, for example the addition of a new curved bar similar to the one that was removed. Also, there is an opportunity to add leaded lights to the new front windows to complement to the faience frontage. The Principal Conservation Officer has provided visual evidence for this.

The Planning Statement refers to the application being supplemented in due course with a Heritage Impact Assessment. This will be important to explain the full nature and extent of the impact on significance of the listed buildings. In addition to this we consider that at present there is not enough detailed information to explain how the taking down and rebuilding will be achieved. The existing drawings for the Earl de Grey are marked 'work in progress pending survey'. We therefore advise that your Authority should consider requesting the following information prior to consent being granted:

- Structural Report (by a suitably experienced / qualified, preferably conservation accredited structural engineer) that provides adequate assurances that the works are achievable.
- Method Statement for the dismantling and rebuilding for the listed building (by a suitably experienced / qualified specialist). This should include an inventory of all building components to be reused including brickwork and be submitted for written approval by the LPA.
- Method Statement for moving the faience façade (by a suitably experienced / qualified specialist) should be submitted for written approval by the LPA.
- Recording - prior to any demolition, the building must be subject to a Level 4 building recording in accordance with Historic England guidance contained in 'Understanding Historic Buildings - A Guide to Good Recording Practice', 2016
- Phasing Plan (related to conditions attached to any consent granted) to ensure that the works to the Listed Buildings are implemented to an agreed timetable and prior to the occupancy of the hotel. The relocation of the Earl de Grey should ideally be the first phase of the development.
- Public Art Strategy, ideally as a formally adopted document attached to a condition for timely implementation, for the new courtyard area including the external spaces around the two listed buildings, relating to interpreting and showcasing their heritage significance. For example, traditional signwriting and artwork on the gable end. The site of the public house should be marked out on the ground as a decorative piece of artwork that interprets the original site of the public house. This could also include details of the form and design of new site boundary treatment to the south of the site which will provide an all-important acoustic and visual barrier to the A63 benefiting the space. This could also be an attractive new feature within the space.

The following principles for the rebuilding should also be agreed with the LPA:



37 TANNER ROW YORK YO1 6WP

Telephone 01904 601948
HistoricEngland.org.uk



- The taking down and rebuilding of the Earl de Grey will re-use all of the existing fabric.
- Where any new materials are required they should be of the highest quality traditional materials and use traditional heritage craft skills including lime mortars and renders, involving apprenticeships and training in all aspects of the works.

Extension to the listed buildings - we have no objection to the size, form, height or materials proposed for the new single storey extension to the rear of the listed buildings. The new addition will be subservient to the principal listed buildings in terms of scale and the contemporary design means that it will clearly be a later addition. We do advise that this should be the location for new servicing as far as possible to avoid impacting on the historic character of the listed buildings. We advise that the details should be agreed with your Principal Conservation Officer to ensure that this new addition is a high quality that makes a positive contribution to the setting of the listed buildings and their new courtyard.

The new hotel building is a tall and bulky structure. However, historic maps and images show that historically the area surrounding the listed buildings contained large warehouses relating to the docks. The current context of the recently erected Bonus Arena and the Princes Quay Shopping Centre demonstrate how this area has been the subject of major change and redevelopment over the course of the twentieth century. We therefore consider that the setting of the listed buildings can accommodate the degree of change proposed and that this would not damage their heritage significance. Locating the hotel entrance on Waterhouse Lane will strengthen the active frontage facing the Bonus Arena and makes it even more important to bring the Earl de Grey frontage forward to ensure it does not appear diminutive in the hierarchy of buildings.

Recommendation

Historic England is supportive in principle but we have some concerns regarding the detail of the application.

We consider that the issues and safeguard outlined in our advice need to be addressed in order for the applications to meet the requirements of paragraphs 184, 192, 193 - 196, 198, 199 and 200 of the NPPF.

In determining these applications you should bear in mind the statutory duty of sections 16(2) and 66(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 to have special regard to the desirability of preserving listed buildings or their setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess and section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 to determine planning applications in accordance with the development plan unless material



37 TANNER ROW YORK YO1 6WP

Telephone 01904 601948
HistoricEngland.org.uk





Historic England

considerations indicate otherwise.

Your authority should take these representations into account and seek amendments, safeguards or further information as set out in our advice. If there are any material changes to the proposals, or you would like further advice, please contact us.

Yours sincerely

Kerry Babington

Inspector of Historic Buildings and Areas

E-mail: kerry.babington@HistoricEngland.org.uk

cc:



37 TANNER ROW YORK YO1 6WP

Telephone 01904 601948
HistoricEngland.org.uk



Historic England is subject to both the Freedom of Information Act (2000) and Environmental Information Regulations (2004). Any Information held by the organisation can be requested for release under this legislation.